MINUTES OF MEETING NEW JERSEY PUBLIC EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS COMMISSION May 26, 2016 10:00 a.m. 495 West State Street Trenton, New Jersey

The meeting was called to order by Chair P. Kelly Hatfield.

Present were:

Commissioners:

John Bonanni Paul Boudreau John Eskilson David Jones Paula Voos

Also present were:

Robin T. McMahon, General Counsel Joseph Blaney, Deputy General Counsel David Gambert, Deputy General Counsel Frank Kanther, Deputy General Counsel Christine Lucarelli-Carneiro, Deputy General Counsel Kellie Hullfish, who acted as Stenographer

At the commencement of the meeting, Chair Hatfield, pursuant to Section 5 of the Open Public Meetings Act, entered this announcement into the minutes of the meeting:

Adequate notice has been provided by the dissemination of a written "Annual Notice of Meeting." On December 17, 2015 a copy of such notice was:

(a) prominently posted in a public place at the offices of the Public Employment Relations Commission;

(b) sent to the business offices of the Trenton Times and the Courier Post, as well as to the State House press row addresses of 25 media outlets;

(c) copies e-mailed to the Secretary of State for filing; and

(d) posted on the agency's web site.

Furthermore on May 19, 2016, copies of an additional written "Notice of Meeting" were posted and sent in a similar manner.

The Counsel's Office distributed a monthly report.

The first item on the agenda was the minutes of the April 28, 2016 regular Commission meeting. A motion to adopt the minutes was made by Commissioner Eskilson and seconded by Commissioner Bonanni. The motion to adopt the minutes was unanimously approved (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni and Eskilson). Commissioners Boudreau, Jones and Voos were not present at that meeting and abstained from voting.

The first case for consideration was the draft decision in <u>Elizabeth Board of Education and Elizabeth Education Association</u>, Docket No. SN-2016-033. Commissioner Jones moved the draft decision and Commissioner Voos seconded the motion. Commissioner Bonanni was recused from voting on this matter because the law firm of DeCotiis, Fitzpatrick & Cole represents Morris County in negotiations with the State over a land deal. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of five in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Boudreau, Eskilson Jones and Voos) and one recusal (Commissioner Bonanni).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in <u>Elizabeth Board of Education and Elizabeth Education Association</u>, Docket No. SN-2016-038. Commissioner Boudreau moved the draft decision and Commissioner Eskilson seconded the motion. Commissioner Bonanni was recused from voting because the law firm of DeCotiis, Fitzpatrick & Cole represents Morris County in

negotiations with the State over a land deal. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of four in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Boudreau, Eskilson and Voos), one opposed (Commissioner Jones) and one recusal (Commissioner Bonanni).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in <u>Township of Old Bridge and PBA Local 127</u>, Docket No. SN-2016-029. Commissioner Voos moved the draft decision and Commissioner Boudreau seconded the motion. Commissioner Bonanni was recused from voting because the law firm Cleary, Giacobbe, Alfieri & Jacobs is one of the labor counsels for Morris County. Commissioner Eskilson was recused because of the connection between the City of Paterson, where he serves as Fiscal Oversight Officer, and the Mets, Schiro & McGovern law firm, which provides legal services to unions representing City workers. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of three in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Boudreau and Voos), one opposed (Commissioner Jones) and two recusals (Commissioners Bonanni and Eskilson).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in <u>Monmouth County Sheriff's Office and PBA Local 240</u>, Docket No. SN-2016-041. Commissioner Eskilson moved the draft decision and Commissioner Boudreau seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of five in favor (Chair

-3-

Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau, Eskilson and Voos) and one opposed (Commissioner Jones).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in <u>City of Elizabeth and PBA Local No. 4</u>, Docket No. SN-2015-081. Commissioner Jones moved the draft decision and Commissioner Voos seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the draft decision was unanimously approved (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau, Eskilson, Jones and Voos).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in <u>City of Hoboken and IAFF Local 1076</u>, Docket No. CO-2015-064. Commissioner Eskilson moved the draft decision and Commissioner Boudreau seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of four in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau and Eskilson) and two opposed (Commissioners Jones and Voos).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in <u>State of New Jersey and Council of New Jersey State College</u> <u>Locals, AFT</u>, Docket No. SN-2015-031. Commissioner Boudreau moved the draft decision and Commissioner Bonanni seconded the motion. Commissioner Eskilson was recused because of the connection between the City of Paterson, where he serves as Fiscal Oversight Officer, and the Mets, Schiro & McGovern law firm, which provides legal services to unions representing City workers. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of four in

-4-

favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau and Voos), one opposed (Commissioner Jones) and two recusals (Commissioners Bonanni and Eskilson).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in <u>State of New Jersey and New Jersey Law Enforcement Supervisors</u> <u>Association</u>, Docket No. SN-2016-002. Commissioner Boudreau moved the draft decision and Commissioner Bonanni seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of four in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau and Eskilson) and two opposed (Commissioners Jones and Voos).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in <u>Clifton Board of Education and Clifton Custodial Association</u>, Docket No. SN-2016-030. Commissioner Jones moved the draft decision and Commissioner Voos seconded the motion. Commissioner Bonanni was recused from voting because the law firm Cleary, Giacobbe, Alfieri & Jacobs is one of the labor counsels for Morris County. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of five in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Boudreau, Eskilson, Jones and Voos) and one recusal (Commissioner Bonanni).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in <u>City of Elizabeth and Elizabeth Superior Officers Association</u>, Docket No. SN-2016-046 and <u>City of Elizabeth and PBA Local 4</u>, Docket No. SN-2016-047. Commissioner Boudreau moved the draft

-5-

decision and Commissioner Voos seconded the motion. Commissioner Eskilson was recused from voting on this matter because of the connection between the City of Paterson, where he serves as Fiscal Oversight Officer, and the Mets, Schiro & McGovern law firm, which provides legal services to unions representing City workers. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of four in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau and Voos), one opposed (Commissioner Jones) and one recusal (Commissioner Eskilson).

The last case for consideration was the draft decision in <u>Marlboro Township Board of Education and Marlboro Township</u> <u>Education Association</u>, Docket No. SN-2016-048. Commissioner Voos moved the draft decision and Chair Hatfield seconded the motion. Commissioner Bonanni was recused from voting on this matter because the law firm Schenck, Price, Smith & King is his personal attorney. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of five in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Boudreau, Eskilson, Jones and Voos) and one recusal (Commissioner Bonanni).

Commissioner Eskilson made a motion to adjourn the meeting and Commissioner Boudreau seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved. The meeting was then adjourned.

The next regular meeting is scheduled to be held on Thursday, June 30, 2016.

-6-